



Letters from John A. Carlyle to Charles Butler

CHARLES BUTLER (1802–97) WAS AN AMERICAN ENTREPRENEUR, lawyer, broker, and philanthropist who was also at the center of one of New York's great, nineteenth-century intellectual salons. The Butlers came into the Carlyles' lives during a tour of Europe in the early 1850s, and Butler particularly pleased TC by rescuing some Illinois bonds that he had abandoned to loss. For several years after, TC regularly sent large sums for Butler to invest in American railroads. Butler dutifully returned an accounting of his efforts on TC's behalf, as well as much appreciated dividends twice annually, in February and August. With the increasing demands of writing his life of Frederick the Great, TC assigned the management of his American investments to his brother John (JAC) and to the Dumfries banker Robert Adamson.

This new arrangement led inevitably to the writing of letters. The cache of twelve letters included here (with a thirteenth to Charles Butler from the Reverend Gerald Blunt) was acquired by Edinburgh University Library (EUL) in 1987, apparently at the same time and from the same New York antiquities dealer that the library obtained sixteen letters to Butler from Thomas Carlyle (TC) and thirty-nine letters to Butler from James Anthony Froude. The TC to Butler letters were first presented in number 22 of *Carlyle Studies Annual*, and since that initial publication, they have been copiously annotated and placed in chronological context within *The Collected Letters of Thomas and Jane Welsh Carlyle*.

We are once again most grateful for the assistance of Jean Archibald, retired EUL librarian, who not only collected and forwarded copies of the holographs to the editors, but who also reviewed and corrected the early transcriptions that are archived with them at EUL.



From its context, it is clear that this letter of 1 October 1864 is not the first from JAC to Butler. In that year, Jane Carlyle (JWC) suffered

terribly from a number of maladies, beginning with an accident in the street, 22 September 1863, from which she never entirely recovered. In the first week of March 1864, JWC was sent by ambulance and rail to the seaside resort town of St. Leonards where she came under the care of Dr. Blakiston and his wife, Bessey Barnett, once the servant of the Carlyles. She took lodgings at The Marina near Blakiston's practice, and TC visited regularly. Though JWC rallied at times, she hoped for improvements did not come at St. Leonards, and in July, after "twelve successive nights of burning summer, totally without sleep" JWC, escorted by JAC, set off, via London, for her sister-in-law Mary Austin's at the Gill in Scotland. From there, she moved to nearby Thornhill and the nurturing hospitality of her dearest friend, Mary Russell, and Mary's country physician husband. JWC remained with the Russells at Thornhill until the end of September, and it may be said that they not only restored her health but also prolonged her life.

5 Cheyne Row, Chelsea
1st October 1864

My dear Sir,

Two days ago I received your kind letter of 13th September at Dumfries, & have just arrived here today with my sister-in-law from Thornhill. She is a great deal better than when I last wrote to you, has gained more than a stone in weight, is generally free from pain, & now that she is at home one may hope that she will soon be able to return to all her old habits. My brother himself too is looking unusually well, tho' he has been working at his task without intermission since we left him at St Leonards in July. He hopes to get the whole of it off his hands before the end of December, if he continues as well as at present; & will then write to you himself. In the meantime I am to acknowledge receipt of the Statement you enclose in your letter, & say that he feels very much obliged for all the trouble you have taken on his account, & finds the Statement perfectly clear & satisfactory, & desires only that any future Dividends may be invested or remitted just as you think best in the circumstances, he having no immediate need of the money. Both he & Mrs Carlyle send kindest regards. She is of course rather fatigued with her long journey, we having travelled all night & had no sleep amidst the noise. This is Mail-day for the United States, & I cannot delay acknowledging receipt of your letter & its enclosure by first opportunity—

Yours most sincerely,

J A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq
New York



TC completed his life of Frederick in February 1865, and the Carlyles learned anew how to enjoy the society of their friends after twelve years of enduring life in the “valley of the shadow of Frederick.” In the United States, the Civil War war ended officially with a series of four surrenders in April and May. The Carlyles took separate holidays in Scotland, with JWC staying at the Russells in Thornhill and with TC staying mostly at the Gill. By the beginning of August, JWC had returned to Chelsea, and in the middle of that month she went to stay with Miss Davenport Bromley at 4 Langhorne Gardens on the Folkestone leas.

The Hill, Dumfries
4th Septr 1865
Charles Butler Esq

My dear Sir,

On the evening of Thursday last (31st Augt) I received your kind letter, enclosing a brief & most clear & satisfactory statement of my brothers affairs; and I at once forwarded both to him by the post of that same evening. He & his wife happened to be making a call out of town at Ruskin’s next day, & did not get back in time for the post, otherwise I should have written to you by the mail of Saturday. Yesterday I had the expected answer from Chelsea, & now I write in time for the mail of next Wednesday morning.

My brother instructs me to thank you “in the most obliging terms I can find.” He says: “Tell him from me that I am altogether satisfied, & very grateful, & indeed quite ashamed at the pious trouble he has taken in regard to that small matter. That I shall be delighted to hear from him, & then to write to him. That I am very glad of the huge change from War & Madness to Peace & Sanity:—& shall be well pleased with sight of gold instead of greenbacks, as one small token of that blessed consummation”! For the rest, that in regard to “transmitting of interest on tolerable terms” or “reinvesting it,” I leave Mr Butler, as I ought, sole judge;—

& in fine that I beg him to accept the inclosed Photograph, that he may really “see how I look” now that *Friedrich* is done. Enough!”

My brother came to Scotland in May, & staid rather more than three months, leaving us only last Monday. He & I went to Edinburgh for a week or two, & made visits to Mr Erskine, Mrs Stirling of Kier & others in that neighbourhood. When he came here in May he looked considerably shaken & worn by his long labour, but had gained strength & much better health when he started again for Chelsea. Mrs C. also was in Scotland for almost the whole of July, & then at Folkstone for some weeks. She has had no return of last year’s illness, but had swelling of the right arm from what the doctors called rheumatic gout, which took away her power of writing. She is now nearly well again, can write freely, & was at home when my brother arrived there. On the whole it seemed to me that both got wonderfully well through the long tear & wear of *Frederick*, which I often feared might prove fatal to both. The photograph was taken in May last, one day after he had gone out to ride & halted two minutes at the artist’s to ask about something else. The likeness is better than usual in photographs. This letter, I find, will carry another free of cost, & as I have been getting a number lately from Edin^g I request your acceptance of one from me too—

I am, Dear Sir

Very sincerely yours,

J A Carlyle



Eerily, this letter was written a mere fortnight before JWC’s sudden death on the afternoon of 21 April, while taking her daily drive in her brougham. Though TC delivered his inauguration address from notes, stenographers reported his speech verbatim, and transcriptions, both authorized and unauthorized, appeared immediately.

Edinburgh, 6th April 1866

My dear Sir,

I have today received your kind letter, enclosing Draft of £70-6-0 for my brother Thomas, together with a most brief & clear statement of his account, which even to him is quite intelligible.

He is now here. We both left London last week, he having to go through his Inauguration as Lord Rector of the university of Edinburgh on Monday 2nd April. I send you by this mail a Scotsman (newspaper) which contains an excellent & quite literal report of the address he gave on the occasion. He had only meditated the *heads* of it beforehand, & did not know what the inspiration of the moment would give him to say, or whether he might not altogether break down; & he got through without hesitation.

He desires me to send kindest respects & thanks to you. Both he & Mrs C. have been tolerably well during the whole of the winter, though his installation made them both rather anxious in prospect. She drives out daily with perfect punctuality, & has hitherto had no return of the pain which afflicted her so much in the summer of 1864. He walks as of old three or four times each day, but has given up his riding since he got done with his Book. Tomorrow he starts for native Annandale, purposing to rest himself there for a week or ten days & then go home to Chelsea. I stay here a little longer & return to Dumfries. Today we have had visitings among old Edin^r friends, & I have little time for writing but wish to save our first post.

There have been no new photographs of my brother made since I last wrote, but I enclose one of myself—

I remain,
very sincerely yours,

J A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq
New York



Butler's letter of condolence to TC likely arrived in late June or in mid-July, when JAC was on the island of Jersey in preparation for, and in attendance at, the wedding of his youngest stepson William Watt, an officer in the royal dragoons. Miss Maggie Welsh of Liverpool kept house at 5 Cheyne Row for several months after the death of JWC. Miss Davenport Bromley, close friend of JWC, was TC's host in Kent.

The Hill, Dumfries
Augt 23^d 1866

My dear Sir,

Your kind letter of condolence after the sudden death of my brother's wife I fear was not answered at the time, for I was absent in the Channel Islands & my brother himself could write no letters, when it arrived. He remained in his own house till the 13th of this month, Miss Welsh a cousin of Mrs Carlyle's staying with him, & then went off to some friends near Dover & Walmer Castle to have a week or two of sea-bathing & country rides. I also staid with him for some time after his great loss, & of course he felt it most keenly; but before I left him he had begun to occupy himself with some kind of writing in his own room every morning, & also with reading in the evenings. I staid two days with him on my return from Jersey about three weeks ago, & thought him looking rather better. And I have had several letters from him since indicating that he continues tolerably well in the country too. He has to go next month to Lady Ashburton's too, in Devonshire & near the sea; & I think his is likely to feel the benefit of such little changes more when he gets back to his own quiet house than he seems to do at present. He had the usual painful arrangements to go through during the first few weeks after his bereavement, & the suddenness of his wife's death had made them in some respects difficult. However everything was got done satisfactorily at last. Her grandfather had fourteen children, five or six of them sons who grew up; & yet not one male remains of the kindred, the last having died last spring. So I daresay it is likely that my brother, the old family being all dead out, will have Craigenputtock applied to some public end of a suitable kind. In the Times paper you would see the inscription put on Mrs Carlyle's grave, & also a description of the spot where she in interred — both accurately given.

I cannot feel quite certain that I did not write to you after receipt of your letter above-mentioned, or that I had actually started for Jersey when it arrived. The only thing I remember clearly is that I had all such letters— & they were very numerous at the time—to answer for my brother; & that yours was considerably addressed to myself & should have been answered at once. But I trust you will pardon any apparent negligence there may have been in the matter,

I remain,

yours sincerely

J A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq



Mentone, a resort village on the Mediterranean coast about 15 miles northeast of Nice, was ceded to France in 1860, after which it soon became a warm winter destination for the European aristocracy. Though it was planned that JWC's cousin Maggie Welsh would go to Mentone with TC, it was Professor John Tyndall who accompanied him, finally. Caroline Fox, another visitor to the Ashburton villa that winter, described TC as "thin and aged, and as sad as Jeremiah . . . reading Shakespeare, in a long dressing-gown, a drab comforter wrapped round and round his neck."

The Hill, Dumfries

25th May 1867

My dear Sir,

I went to London in March to meet my brother on his return from Mentone where he had spent the winter with Lady Ashburton & other friends. I thought he looked better than at any previous time since Mrs Carlyle's death. There had been no winter weather at Mentone, & he had lived there very quietly & taken an interest in all the new kind of people he saw. I staid some two months with him at Cheyne Row, & have heard from him regularly since I returned here. He has been sorting all his papers & putting his affairs in order. Every day at Mentone, & also at Chelsea while I was there, he occupied himself a few hours in writing, as has always been his habit.

Yesterday I had a letter from him, in which he requests me to write to you with his kind regards, & ask your advice with regard to the money-investments he has in America. Lady Ashburton, he tells me, has large Estates left her by her late husband, from which she has for the last three years got no income at all, & has had to send her case to your Chancery which seems to delay somewhat like our own in England. "Now it strikes me at the moment," says my brother "that in case of any *decease*, Heirs *may* have to go into the American Chancery &c. & undergo a

great deal of bother & delay, — somewhat as the present Dowry Lady A has had. Or perhaps this does not apply to inheritors of Shares, but the mere *share-document* (if I have such?) is valid for any Holder? I really wish you would write to Butler upon this last question,—which seems too me of immediate interest (if lying as Lady A. found it, or in the least involving difficulties to *Heirs*)! Say I requested you, with my kind regards to him”

In another part of the same letter, after speaking of some English R. W. Shares he holds which have fallen much in value & *wh* I had advised him to sell at once, he says: My American things too are considerably unpleasant, but I keep hoping there will come a fitter or cheaper time for bringing them over *hither*,—as I should truly like them to *be*. If you please, write to Butler & *consult* him?”

I may also mention that my brother's books continue to sell better & better every year. For the year that ended last March he received nearly £1000 from his publisher. And now I need not say more on the subject, as you have all the materials for forming an opinion.

I enclose another photograph—by far the best of Mrs Carlyle. My brother has had it enamelled at Paris, from the negative, most successfully—by some newly invented process,—& has got it framed—

I remain,
very sincerely yours,

J A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq
Wall Street
New York



Alexander Macmillan (1818–96; ODNB) and his brother Daniel Macmillan (1813–57; ODNB), sons of crofters from the Isle of Arran, founded the prestigious publishing house that bears their name. Alexander visited the United States in 1868 to prepare for the opening of Macmillan's New York office. The Carlyles' friend David Masson was the first editor of Macmillan's Magazine.

The Hill, Dumfries

17th March 1868

My dear Sir,

In November last Mr Macmillan duly forwarded to me your two Photographs, & I was very glad to see them & have them here beside me. He also called at Cheyne Row, quite full of the great things he had seen in his short visit to America.

I am glad to say that my brother has got through the winter tolerably well. Mrs Aitken, our sister who lives here, staid three months with him, & left him only last Saturday, to visit a son & daughter she has in Liverpool & then come home again to Dumfries.

In writing to my brother last week I said that it is quite a common thing to have American Bonds lodged in the Banks here & get the coupons paid from London. And I said also that I thought the security of those you had purchased for him as good as that of any British Railways & the interest too as high even at the present rates of remittance; & asked him whether it might not be better to have his Bonds sent to Dumfries. In reply I have just received the enclosed little note, & at once forward it to you to be acted upon so as to fulfil his wishes in the way you think best. I hold American Bonds myself, lodged in a Scotch Bank, but know almost nothing about them except that they have been very profitable & are always saleable here at once.

We expected to see you in England last autumn, as you had mentioned to me your intention of passing through to Italy to bring back your daughter who was there, when you wrote to me just as you were starting for *St Louis*. I hope she is now well and with you at home. If you wrote again to me at any later date your letter must have miscarried.

I enclose one Photograph more of Mrs Carlyle, which I think you have not yet seen. The likeness is very good in its way—

I remain,

very sincerely yours,

J A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq



The Dumfries branch of the British Linen Company Bank was managed by Robert Adamson, and after his death by his nephew Samuel Adamson. The Adamsons, with JAC, oversaw the fiscal details of TC's American investments. Stratton Park in Hampshire was the seat of Thomas Baring, Lord Northbrook (1826–1904; ODNB), Lord Ashburton's cousin who became Viceroy of India after the assassination of Lord Mayo in 1872.

The Hill, Dumfries
27th April 1868

My dear Sir,

By the post of yesterday I received your kind letter of the 14th together with the Eighteen Railroad Bonds for my brother Thomas Carlyle, of 1000 Dollars each, & corresponding exactly with the list enclosed by you which describes them. And today I have already lodged them in the British Linen Co's Bank here with which he has always kept his accounts.

I am just on the point of starting for London, but have to go by Liverpool &c. & might arrive too late in Chelsea for next mail to New York on the 29th, so it seems better to write at once & tell you that the Securities you have taken so much pains with on my brother's account have arrived punctually. It was a relief to me to hear that you also thought it best to have them sent at once to this country.

I had a letter yesterday from Chelsea. My brother had just come back from a visit to Stratton Park in Hampshire where there is an old friend of his, & relation of the late *Ld* Ashburton, very near The Grange to which my brother & his wife used to go so often in years that are past. Lady Ashburton still has the same difficulties I mentioned to you last year in regard to the realization of her landed property in the United States, owing I suppose to want of skill in her English lawyers whose advice she depends on.

My brother says he is pretty well. He is at present occupied in getting ready what is called a Library Edition of his Cromwell, & a stereotype of Frederick. He & I talk of going to try the waters of Vichy in May or June, but nothing has yet been finally decided in the matter. I enclose a new photograph of him taken

last month, which is by far the best I have seen of him, & may be put into your collection along with the last one of Mrs Carlyle. I will write again when your promised letter of next mail after the "Australasian" arrives—

Most sincerely yours

A Carlyle

Charles Butler Esq
New York



Had he not predeceased TC, John Forster (1812–76; ODNB), biographer, critic, editor, and actor, would have been his literary executor. Acting in concert with JWC's physician Richard Quain, Forster blocked a medical examination following her death, knowing full well that such an invasive procedure would have traumatized TC.

Chelsea 8th May 1868

My dear Sir,

Two days ago I wrote to you acknowledging receipt of the Notarial Certificate for the 18 Bonds I had received from you for my brother Thomas Carlyle, & stated that your Summary of Accts with him had been found quite clear & satisfactory. He himself added a postscript to my letter, & also sent off by Book post a number of Cartes for you of notable people here.

I had written also to the Bank agent at Dumfries who happened to be from home, & today have a letter from him enclosing the only certificate he had connected with those Bonds; & I forward it to you, in addition to your own certificate forwarded two days ago in my last letter. I need only add that my brother continues pretty well, & may perhaps go next week with me after all to try the waters of Vichy, all his friends here having urged him to do so particularly Mr Forster (author of *A Statesman of the Commonwealth*, *Life of Goldsmith*, *Arrest of Five Members* &c.) who kindly manages all affairs with his publishers & printers, & who has just called here today for final arrangements about the Library Edition I spoke of in a former letter—

I remain

yours sincerely,
 J A Carlyle



Louisa Lady Ashburton kept a residence at Melchet Court, near Romsey Hampshire, until her death in 1903. A photograph of Thomas Woolner's celebrated bust of TC is in volume six of the Carlyle photograph albums at Butler Library, Columbia University.

The Hill, Dumfries
 20 May 1871

My dear Mr Butler,

Your kind letter of the 6th has arrived this evening, & I am very glad to hear of your continued welfare. My brother has for the last fortnight been on a visit at Lady Ashburton's, Melchet Court, Romsey, but intends to be home again next week; & I am to go & see him as soon as possible whenever he does get back. I hear from him constantly at least once every week, but have not seen him since he was here in September last. He has got the whole of his works published in what is called the "Library Edition" of thirty volumes; corrected the final proofs himself, making no alterations at all, only rectifying errors wherever he could discover any. A "People's Edition" in the same number of volumes has been begun, but he has no charge of it at all, the printers having merely to follow the Library Edition which is stereotyped. He has not been in much worse health than usual during the winter though it was more severe than any winter we have had for a long while. Dyspepsia is what he suffers from, & for the last fifty years it has never been a stranger to him— a good deal of it having been occasioned I daresay by overwork.

I write these few lines at once, & will write again when I get to Chelsea at greater length. There is a talk of our taking some long voyage during the summer— to Norway or some other place; but whether any thing will come of it or not it is impossible to say till I get to Chelsea.

I enclose a photograph of Woolner's bust of my brother, which is perhaps the best likeness of him. All well here—

Very sincerely yours,

J A Carlyle



The “clever little niece” who stayed with TC was Mary Aitken who would marry her Canadian cousin Alexander Carlyle in 1879. Lyulph Stanley was one of many English guests who stayed at the Butlers’ Park Avenue home.

Chelsea, 6th June 1871

My dear Mr Butler,

When I received your kind note last month at Dumfries, I immediately sent you a brief answer, promising to write again when I got to London & had seen my brother. I came here late on Saturday last & now fulfil that promise.

The stay of three weeks with Lady Ashburton at Melchet proved very beneficial, & my brother looks fully as well as usual— I should say better than when he was at Dumfries last summer. He still gets a little writing done every day, I think, though his hand shakes so much that he has generally to write with a pencil instead of steel pen. He never tells any one what he is writing about, & does not like to be asked. A clever little niece of his from Dumfries, who writes rapidly, stays with him & has staid for some three years; but he finds that he is “too old for acquiring the habit of dictation” which has never hitherto been necessary at any period of his life. He bids me send his very kindest regards to you, & say that he intends to send you a book of which the last volume is not yet quite ready. He has always a very lively sense of your kindness & the pleasure he had in seeing you while you were in this country. Nothing has yet been decided in regard to the projects I spoke of regarding summer excursions which we had been thinking of. Only there is a talk of going too the Isle of Lewis for July at least along with Lady Ashburton & her little daughter.

We still have unusually cold weather for this month of June, with east wind which overshadows Chelsea with remains of smoke from the City floating high in the air— as it does today.

Yesterday Miss Stanley called & had much to say about the adventures of her brother Lyulph whom you know. He went to Paris during the last days of the Commune, was put into prison

accused as a spy, got out with difficulty, & then had fresh difficulties with the soldiers from Versailles. However he was set free without injury at the last.

Hoping that this will find you all quite well,

I remain

yours very sincerely

J A Carlyle



Charles Butler had invested most profitably in the nascent city of Chicago and in its railroads; the great Chicago fire occurred 8–10 October 1871 and destroyed the easternmost third of the city, adjacent to Lake Michigan. The assassination of Lord Mayo occurred on 8 February 1872; news of the appointment of his successor, Lord Northbrook, was inadvertently leaked by Richard Quain, physician to Lady Ashburton and once physician to JWC.

The Hill, Dumfries

13th Feb. 1872

My dear Mr Butler,

I was very glad to see your letters which arrived here last week. I read them both, the one for my brother not being sealed, & immediately sent them on to Chelsea where they were equally welcome. My one was returned by the post of last Saturday night along with a brief note from my brother who happened to be busy with one thing & another at the time he wrote it. I hear from him at least once a week, & he generally has letters to enclose which come from many different countries. He has on the whole been tolerably well during the winter, though we had great rains & fogs since the beginning of December, & no frost at all.

Last summer we went to the Highlands about the beginning of July, & staid till the end of the first week of September. A swift Steamer took us to Aberdeen; &, without halting there, we went straight to Lochluichart lodge where he used often to spend a week of tow with Lord & Lady Ashburton. It is a most quiet & pleasant place, about half-way between Dingwall & Skye, amid birch woods, looking down on the Lake which is some eight miles long. In the course of two or three weeks Lady Ashburton joined

us, & I went to Strathpeffer for the water cure—some twelve off towards Dingwall by the Skye railway—generally spending the Saturdays & Sundays at the Lodge. We ended by going to Kyle Akin in Skye where we had excellent sea-bathing for a week of ten days. My brother felt much better when we started for home again in Sept^r, came & spent some three weeks here on his way to Chelsea. A young niece, Mary C. Aitken, daughter of our sister here, has staid constantly with him for the last two years & is most useful to him in all respects. He is now in his 77th year, & cannot expect to be strong again. His hand shakes so much that he is not able to write with any thing except a pencil, & that is one of his greatest privations, as he has never been accustomed to dictation, but written all his works with his own hand. He has no trouble with the “People’s Edition” of his books, which is merely a copy of the “Library Edition” & left entirely to the printers.

I forget what Photographs I sent to you in May or June last, but will at a venture enclose three from Woolner’s Bust, & one from a Daguerrotype taken long ago. They are the only new ones I have or know of. And you will be able to dispose of them if you already have copies. I can conceive what fearful anxiety you must all have been in when you first heard of the terrible fire in Chicago. Even here the news of it by telegraph was most distressing tho’ no one had connections or relations in that city.

I must now end here. I send also by this post a Scotch paper, which contains the sad news of Lord Mayo’s assassination by a wretched convict. I have had details about his government of India by one with him there, & think he was one of the best governours that India ever had—

I remain,
yours most sincerely,

J A Carlyle

Woolner’s, I think, is on the whole the best likeness of my brother, tho’ some of the rest are good too.



James Anthony Froude was another Butler correspondent, and he, too, had profited from Butler’s financial acumen and guidance.

The Hill, Dumfries

22nd Feb. 1873

Dear Mr Butler,

My brother Thomas has sent me your very kind little note which Mr Froude delivered to him, & requests me to give you his best thanks for it. His hand shakes so much that he is unable to write himself, though in other respects he is tolerably well. He still takes long walks every day, & has all his faculties as clear as ever, but cannot learn to dictate satisfactorily, never having been accustomed to it in earlier life. He has however succeeded in making a very interesting little addition to the Life of Schiller which of itself was too small for a volume of the 'People's Edition'; & in it there is an account of Schiller's father & mother & sister, which I like very much. The volume is hardly published yet, but will appear very soon.

I have been in Edinburgh most of the winter, & have not seen my brother since September, but I mean to go to London very soon. Last summer I was with him for several months at Chelsea, & then at Seaton in Devonshire for sea-bathing, which did us both much good. He intends it possible to come here for part of next summer if all goes well. Mr Froude is his nearest neighbour in London, & comes to walk with him three or four times every week. They live about half a mile from each other, & have a fixed road between their two houses, so that they may not miss each other whichever of them starts first for the walk. Mr Froude himself came back much pleased & satisfied with his visit to the United States, & felt that he had accomplished all that he intended by it, & got a far higher idea of the best classes of men there than he had started with. His wife had been very anxious about him, & was greatly rejoiced when he got safe home again. Much of his first volume of the 'English in Ireland' which is the only one yet out, is better than any thing else he has yet written, & must do good in the long run.

We have had an extremely wet & disagreeable winter over the whole island, but now have grey weather & temperate which is not at all disagreeable either here or in London. I have a letter from my brother at least once every week, & his last one of the 19th is dictated in good spirits & cheerful in tone. I forget whether I ever sent you a photograph of Woolner's bust of him. It is well done & the likeness good, & as I have plenty of

copies I now enclose one, & remain

Yours most sincerely

J A Carlyle



An Afterword . . .

“A Great Moral Tonic”:

Lecky on Carlyle and *The French Revolution*

OF CARLYLE'S FRIENDS AND ASSOCIATES IN THE 1870S, FEW possessed as rich an insight into the character of the “paradoxical philosopher” as the Irish historian William Edward Hartpole Lecky (1838–1903). In his entry on Lecky in *The Carlyle Encyclopedia*, Kenneth J. Fielding presciently remarks, “Lecky and Carlyle were mutually attracted by their respect for truth, in spite of sharp differences about Ireland, liberalism, and . . . whether ‘might is right’” (275). Lecky's diaries and letters in Trinity College Library, Dublin, which Fielding painstakingly transcribed in 1997, indicate the deep influence that Carlyle's character and writings exerted on his understanding of history, politics, and religion. Poised between a Burkean and a Rationalist perspective of human progress, Lecky was simultaneously intrigued and dismayed by Carlyle's denunciation of “political economy,” utilitarianism, democracy, and “mammon worship.”

Politically, Lecky was a moderate liberal whose ambivalence about Irish nationalism attracted fierce criticism both from opponents and activists, perhaps an inevitable fate for “the first national historian of Ireland and the first ‘revisionist’ of the nationalist idealization of Ireland” (Spence, *ODNB*). Carlyle provoked him on the subject of Ireland several times and wrote slightly of his opinions to others. Their friendship reached a breaking point in 1873 with the publication of Froude's *The English in Ireland* (1872–74). In a series of reviews, Lecky criticized Froude's slipshod methods, and lambasted him for his defense of the penal laws and of the persecutions of Catholics. From Lecky's perspective, Froude's history radiated with a spirit